S.no	Clause Description	Details of Item per Tender Requirement	Query/ Suggestion	<u>Clarifications</u>
M/s 7	TATA Consulting Engineers Private	<mark>vate Limited</mark>		
1	Clause II Page 25	II. Financial Proposal Content Financial proposal must be submitted in the form of all the duly singed forms as per Section 3 of RFP i.e. Technical Proposal-Standard Forms. All amounts quoted in the financial proposal forms must be in Indian Rupees.	Please clarify whether "Technical Proposal-Standard Forms" to be read as "Financial Proposal-Standard Forms.	Pl refer Addendum-III.
2	Marking Methodology: Pages 28 & 29	Marking methodology to include normalization of technical and commercial scores:	scores formulae and modify the same as in QCBS procedure, which is as under: Total points (S) = T (w) x T (s) + F (w) x LEC / EC, where T (w) stands for weight of the technical score (70%). T (s) stands for technical score of the Bidder. F (w) stands for weight of the financial proposal (30%). EC stands for Evaluated Cost of the financial proposal of the Bidder. LEC stands for Lowest Evaluated Cost of the financial proposal.	Tender Condition Prevails
3	Clause 13.	Payment Schedule	Please confirm that all stages of Payment will be paid on	Tender Condition Prevails
	Page 33		raymont win be puid on	

			Pro-rata basis on the No. of Major Ports.	
4	Key Deliverables and timeframe Pg. No 31	Complete survey of transmission pipelines and preparation of 'L' Section drawings showing location/routing of the pipelines.	We request you please confirm the extent of survey to be carried out in Kms. as part of scope	100 km per port be considered as the extent of L-section survey required in the quotation. If it exceeds, no payment will be made.
5	Key Deliverables and timeframe Pg. No 32	As per requirement or Standard Process	We request you please indicate the time frame to be considered for both item No 3 & 4 of Key Deliverables and timeframe	Time frame for: Item 3, preparing detail cost estimate technical and commercial specification and tender document – 15 days Item 4 - Financial Advisory and Bid process management – 45 days) Pl refer Addendum-III
6	General		We request you please confirm the extent of geotechnical investigation to be carried out as part of scope.	Yes
7	General		We request you to consider the maximum Liability under this Consultancy contract shall be limited to 10% of the Consultancy Contract amount.	•
8	General		Kindly furnish the project details/ extend of project reports / surveys/ field investigation details available for 12 Major Ports.	Details will be furnished for the selected consultant.
9	General		We request you to give us at least	Pl refer Addendum-II

			three weeks time for submission of bid from date of receipt of pre-bid clarifications.	
M/s	M/s Almondz Global Securities Limited			
10	General Query	Transaction Advisor/ Financial Modeller (1 No): Graduate in Engineering and Post graduate/ MBA	We request the authority to kindly change this requirement to "Post graduate in Management / MBA/ CA"	Pl refer Addendum-III
11	General Query	Addition of Legal Expert	Since the scope consists of drafting of tender documents, etc we request the authority to kindly include a Legal Expert as an expert with the following criteria: Education – Graduate in Law Total Experience – 10 Years Experience on eligible assignments - • Experience in drafting contractual agreements and other related documents/agreements • Successful preparation of documents for PPP projects with either a LOI has been issued to the preferred bidder or Concession Agreement executed.	Tender Conditions prevails.

12	General Query	The Key Personnel shall be deployed on full time basis and must be full time employee(s) of the firm.	This condition is very restrictive as some experts are usually hired on project basis thus, we request the authority to drop this condition of full time employees.	Tender Condition prevails.
13	General Query	Total Project Cost / Budget	We request the authority to kindly mention the Total Project Cost or the budget for this project.	The consultant shall study the extent of work involved and quote for the consultancy assignment.
14	General Query	Duration	We request the authority to kindly mention the duration / time-period of the assignment.	Please refer clarification to point 30 Pl refer Addendum-III
15	General Query	Drawings in DPR	We request the authority to clarify whether drawings are to be submitted in the DPR work.	Yes. The successful consultant has to submit the drawings along with the DPR work
16	General Query	Joint Venture / Consortium/Association	We request the authority to kindly allow Joint Venture / Consortium/Association so as to ensure wider participation and healthy competition. In a similar case National Mission for Clean Ganga while empanelling the consultants, permitted Joint Venture / Consortium / Association	 Number of members in a Joint Venture/ consortium/ Association shall not exceed 2(two). Both members should have relevant experience
			Venture / Consortium / Association.	• The members do hereby undertake to be jointly and severally responsible for all obligations and liabilities relating to the Consultancy and in accordance with the terms of the RFP and the Contract, for the

				performance of the Contract. Pl refer Addendum-III
17	General Query	Composite Score of the Bidders	We request the authority to clearly explain with an illustration the working of the composite score.	Composite score is explained on page no 29.
18	General Query	Payment	We request the authority to make stage wise pro-rata payment for all the 12 projects.	Tender Condition prevails.
19	General Query	Date Extension	We request the authority to kindly extend the due date by 3 weeks.	Pl refer addendum –II
M/s	<mark>Bluestream Infrastructure Deve</mark>	<mark>lopment Consultant Pvt. Ltd</mark> .		
20	Section 1 (Instructions to Consultants), point (n)	As per the definition "Sub-Consultant" means any person or entity with whom the Consultant subcontracts any part of the Assignment/job.	We understand that the subcontracting is allowed. Please clarify the amount of work allowed for subcontracting.	Sub-contracting is not allowed.
21	Clause 13.3	The original and all copies of the Technical Proposal (along with 2 soft copies in word and PDF format in CD or Pen-drive) shall be placed in a sealed envelope clearly marked "TECHNICAL PROPOSAL"	Please clarify the number of hard Copies required in submission i.e. Original + one copy + 2 softcopies Or Original + 2 softcopies	Only one original hardcopy and 2 softcopies in CD/pen drive should be submitted in the form of bid. The financial proposal must be in the form of hardcopy only.
22	Financial Criteria Page No 23	Financial Criteria: The Consultant should have positive Net Worth.	Please clarify whether the net worth certificate is required. If so, the net worth certificate should be of presiding year or current year?	CA certificate should be attached. Net worth certificate should be taken for the year 2015-16.
23	Clause 10, Page No 29	Composite Score of the Bidders It is mentioned in Note that Consultant shall be submitted the self-evaluation sheet as per above criteria along with Technical Proposal with proper page numbering for supporting documents."	We understand that bidders have to submit the self-evaluation sheet to come up with the technical score (Say 'minimum 60 marks) as per the Technical experience sought in the technical criteria. Please clarify.	Self evaluation sheet is required for clause 10.1.2 towards the criteria specified. The approach and methodology will be exclusively evaluated by the IPA. So also the self evaluation will be

				checked by IPA from the certificates produced.
24	Section 2 (Terms of Reference) Page no 19, point (4)	It is mentioned in the TOR that "Exploring the option of collecting and using sewage from the places in the vicinity of the ports."	We understand that the consultant also has to explore the option of collecting and using sewage from the nearby cities and towns to the port areas. Please clarify.	In cases where the port is deficit in water and can use the treated sewage of the nearby cities within 20 Km radius then the same shall be investigated as one of the source.
25	Estimation		Which Schedule of rate will be applicable for this project?	The schedule of rate of concerned state applicable to the area shall be followed. For the items which are not in SoR, the rate analysis based on the market rates of the cities in the vicinity be carried out.
26	Financial Proposal	Consultancy charges/ Fees	We understand that the consultancy charges/ fees are inclusive of Remuneration and out of pocket expenses of the consultant. Please clarify.	Yes. The consultancy charges/ fees are inclusive of Remuneration and out of pocket expenses of the consultant.
27	Technical Proposal – Other Undertakings Point No 1, page no. 39	It is mentioned that "An undertaking stating that firm/organization is not blacklisted by Government or its agencies including Central/State Level Public Enterprises." has to be provided by the consultant.	We request you to please provide us the format for Undertaking.	Undertaking will be given on the plain paper mentioned under section 3)
28	Technical Proposal – Other Undertakings Point No 4, page no. 39	It is mentioned that "An undertaking regarding non-disclosure/sharing of confidential information with third parties." has to be provided by the consultant.	We request you to please provide us the format for Undertaking.	Undertaking will be given on the plain paper mentioned under section 3

29		It is stated that, "The last date of	This tender requires lot of	Pl refer addendum –II.
		online submission of Proposal is 21.12.2016	preparations for techno- commercial bid submission. Also, the tender submission preparation period is too short and hence we request you to please extend the date of submission by 20 days from the current date of submission.	The last date of bid submission will be 10.01.2017
30	Key Deliverables and timeframe Page no. 30,31	It is stated that the completion time for "Feasibility study and preparation of Feasibility Report" is of 4 months and the completion time for "Detailed study and preparation of Detailed Project Report" is of 6 months	While performing Feasibility study and detailed study of all major 12 ports, lots of activities needs to be done which includes site visits and surveys, flow measurements, sewage quality testing, etc. this require more time. Therefore, considering the activities involved in the scope of work, we request you to amend the completion period by considerable time frame.	The time limit as proposed in the bid document is amended as below: 1. Feasibility Study and preparation of Feasibility Report - 4 months 2. Detailed study and preparation of DPR - 6 months. 3. preparing detail cost estimate technical and commercial specification and tender document - 15 days. 4 - Financial Advisory and Bid process management - 45 days Total Time of Completion(12 months)
31	Objectives (a)	It is stated that the objective is to "obtain a better compliance to statutory provisions, international obligations and international best practices with the help of the	It may please be clarified that these Statutory provisions and international obligations and best practices are in respect of environmental obligations of port.	Pl refer Addendum-III Tender Condition Prevails

		consultant"	It may also be pinpointed that which aspects and parameters of environment and which all protocols, standards are to be checked for compliance. This will clearly outline the scope and thus will give you most competitive quote.	
32	Section 2 Terms of Reference (1)	It is stated that the status is to be assessed for 12 major ports	It is requested to please give us the names location and existing details of the ports	The names of the ports are: 1.Kandla (Gujrat), 2.JNPT (Maharashtra), 3.MbPT (Maharashtra), 4.Mormugao port (Goa), 5.NMPT (Karnataka), 6.Cochin Port (Kerala), 7.VoCPT (Tamil Nadu) 8.Chennai Port (Tamil Nadu) 9.Kamaraja Port (Tamil Nadu) 10.VPT (AP) 11.Paradip(Orissa) 12.KoPT (West Bengal)
33	General		It is requested to let us know what kind of help will be extended by IPA to the consultant, so that the individual port provides access to the port areas and facilities and allows the consultants to the information and data from them.	All the permission for visit will be provided by Individual Port.

34	Time of Completion		The time period for the study for 12 major ports shall be minimum one year. It is requested to please confirm the same.	Please refer clarification to point 30.
35	Section 1 clause 12 Performance BG	Performance BG of 10% of the value of project awarded is asked for	10% is very high for consulting firms. We request you to keep it as 5%.	Tender Condition prevails.
36	Page 31 Detailed study and preparation of DPR,	Mapping the city and its waste water treatment facility and port location	Is it compulsory to do mapping the city even if the port location is far away from the respective cities and its feasibility? Clarifications required.	
37	Water quality test reports	Aspects on water quality standards and authority	Who is the authority on water quality standards for different use / Normal limits? Whether respective state pollution control boards or IPA?	Respective state pollution control boards
M/s P	WC Pvt. Ltd.			
38	Page 29	Note: Consultant shall be submitted the self-evaluation sheet as per above criteria along with Technical Proposal with proper page numbering for supporting documents.	Please clarify the meaning of this statement	Please refer clarification to point 23
39	Point No 12 /Page 30 & 31	Key Deliverables and timeframe	Please clarify if the time of completion in months are to be considered from the start date of the assignment. For e.g. the second deliverable Detailed study and DPR preparation-Should the time of completion be	Please refer clarification to point 30

			read as 6 months after start of assignment or 6 months after	
			submission of first deliverable	
			Submission of the denverage	
40		Schedule for receipt of application:	Request for giving at least 15	Pl refer addendum –II
	Page 4	Receipt of offers on or before 3.00	days' time from the date of issue	The last date of bid submission
		pm (1500 Hrs) on 21/12/2016	of pre bid clarifications, for	will be 10.01.2017
			submission of proposal to allow	
41	Page 25	Evaluation of Proposal- The criteria	us to submit a responsive bid. It is requested to consider	Tender Condition prevails.
41	rage 23	for selection of the consulting firm	reassigning the weightage from	Tender Condition prevails.
		would be based on Technical score	70:20 to 80:20 (technical and	
		(70 % weightage) and Financial	financial)	
		score (30% weightage).		
42	Page 26	Technical Criteria- Relevant experience of the key personnel	Request clarification for marks allotted for evaluation of each of	Team Leader cum Design Engineer – 10 marks
		experience of the key personner	the 5 key personnel. Are the 30	Transaction Advisor/ Financial
			marks equally divided among the 5	Modeller – 7 marks
			key personnels or is there a	Process Designer – 5 marks
			differential marking?	Sr. Consultant & Costing Engineer
				5 marksQuantity Surveyor – 3 marks
M/c Al	ia Consulting Solutions Pvt. Ltd.			Quantity Surveyor – 3 marks
43	w Committing Dominons I to Dut			Please refer clarification to point
	Page no. 32	Preparing Detailed cost estimate,	Kindly specify the exact or	30
	Clause 12	technical and commercial	tentative project duration. This	
	Point - 3	specifications and tender documents:	would help in better resource	
		Project Duration:	planning during tender proposal preparation.	
		As per requirement or Standard	preparation.	
		Process		
44				

	Page no. 32 Clause 12 Point - 4	Financial Advisory and Bid Process Management: Project Duration: As per requirement or Standard Process	Kindly specify the exact or tentative project duration. This would help in better resource planning during tender proposal preparation	Please refer clarification to point 30
N/L/ TO	I C I C I C I C I C I C I C I C I C I C			
	xceltech Consultancy and Projects Pvt L			
44	General Query	Kindly mention the name of posts on which services of Feasibility Study and Transaction Advisory Services for Assessment of Reuse of Waste Water Requirement are to be rendered. Also		Please refer clarification to point 32
		mention type of activities are being executed at ports in which waste water is generating and activities in which fresh water is required are sought through RFP.		
45	General Query	Kindly mention the quantity of effluents generated at each port seeking the services through RFP.		The consultant has to study this.
46	General Query	Kindly inform the types, capacity and status of existing treatment facilities at each port.		The consultant has to study this.
47	General Query	What is the effluent parameters of effluents in the above ports, weather all the ports are producing effluent of same nature or the effluent is of different nature? As per our understanding the nature of effluent shall be different depending upon the nature of goods handled at ports,		The consultant has to study this.

		influent parameters.			
48	General Query	Treatability standards and effluent	The consultant has to study this.		
		parameters for the waste treated in			
		STP. What is the proposed used of			
		waste water, clarify?			
49	General Query	Kindly provide the international and	Tender Condition Prevails		
		national parameters of environment,			
		which the IPA seeking to comply			
		through the work.			
50	General Query	As per our understanding, the present			
		water consumption level, quality and	Tender Condition prevails.		
		quantity of water generated from			
		various ports is not precisely known to			
		IPA. All the above sought activities in			
		the RFP are unique in nature. The			
		nature of effluent generated must be			
		different at each Port. For developing			
		the sought infrastructure and other			
		facility need the preliminary study of			
		each port. At this stage of filling the			
		financial proposal is very based on			
		very uncooked information. Therefore,			
		any kind of financial proposal may			
		either be much higher side or lower			
		side. In both the cases the work output,			
		economy and quality of work may			
		suffer. Therefore, to make the work			
		implementation flexible, the financial			
		proposal should be in the form of %			
		cost of project, instead of the quoting			
		in the amount.			
VI/s	M/s Voyants Solution Private Limited.				

51	Section -2 (ToR) page 20/ 52	RFP Page. 20 , Scope	Kindly provide the following details for all the major ports to enable us assess quantum of work: - Water requirement (Present & Future) - Status & details of Present sewage collection system & treatment facilities. - Total Area of the ports	The consultant has to study this.
52	Section -2 (ToR) Sl. No c) page 20/52 Cost estimation and feasibility	RFP Page. 20, Block Cost estimate	It is understood that the responsibility of consultant is only to prepare block cost estimate, detailed design & estimate are not in the scope work.	Detail process and hydraulic designs to find the sizes of the reactors in STPs, TTPs and hydraulic designs to find the pipe line diameters etc are in the scope. The structural designs are however not in the scope of consultancy services.
53	Section -2 (ToR) Clause 12 page 32/52	RFP Page. 32, Deliverable and Time Frame	Kindly specify minimum 6 months time for deliverable stage-3 "Preparing detail Cost & technical & commercial Specifications and tender documents"	Please refer clarification to point 30
54	Section -2 (ToR) Clause 12 page 32/52	RFP Page. 32, Deliverable and Time Frame	Kindly specify minimum 3 months time for deliverable stage-4 " Financial advisory & Bid Process Management"	Please refer clarification to point 30
55	1 Submission date, Page 4/52	Invitation for proposal due date of receipts of bids is on or before 1500 hrs on 21st Dec 2016	Due to considering scale of project, Request the client to extend the bid submission date up to January 10, 2016.	Pl refer addendum –II The last date of bid submission will be 10.01.2017

M/s Ernst & Young LLP					
56	Page No 26 Table for Key professional	Team Leader cum design Engineer	Wastewater recycling with transaction advisory is one of its kind project in India. Considering the same, transaction experience for a team leader is important for successful closure of the project and hence we feel that the team leader should have relatively good PPP / transaction experience. Kindly Confirm.	Pl refer Addendum-III	
57	Page No 26 Table for Key professional	Key Personnel	Considering that the Preparation of Bid document / Transaction on PPP basis is one of the key aspect for successful completion and meet objectives of this assignment, we would like to make a submission that the inputs of a procurement expert and a legal expert is crucial for preparation of bid documents of the highest quality. Kindly confirm	Tender condition prevails	
58	Pg. 26 Table 10.1.2	Technical Criteria	Considering that the Preparation of Bid document / Transaction on PPP basis is one of the key aspect for successful completion and meet objectives of this assignment, we would request you to add the experience of transaction advisory also in the	Tender condition prevails	

			eligibility criteria. Kindly confirm.		
			Tandiy commin		
59	Page No 31, S.No 2./ Detail Study and Preparation of Detailed Project	Collecting data of waste water generated by town and port are, if it is un-sewered85% of the flow shall be measured	The scope pertaining to assessment of un-sewered flow is difficult to quantify. Hence we request you to limit the scope of study to sewered towns only. Kindly confirm.	Tender condition prevails. Please refer clarification to point 24.	
60	Page No 32, S.No 2./ Preparation of detail cost estimate, tender documents and Bid process Management	Timelines	We would request you to quantify both the timelines to ensure that all the bidders are able to consider the total project period for the estimation of financial proposal. Kindly confirm.	Please refer clarification to point 30	
61	Page No. 31 Key Deliverable and Time frame	Time frame for Feasibility Study and DPR	As per the RFP, the time frame for Feasibility Study Phase: 4 Months DPR Phase: 6 Months. We would request you to clarify whether the 6 months for DPR phase is from the start date of project or after completion of 4 months of Feasibility phase. Kindly confirm.	Please refer clarification to point 30	
62	General	JV / Consortium	There is no mention of the JV / Consortium in the RFP document. We would request you to allow JV / Consortium. Kindly confirm.	Please refer clarification to point 16 Pl refer Addendum III.	
M/s R	M/s REPL				
63	Transaction Advisor/ Financial	Graduate in Engineering and Post	We request the authority to	Pl refer Addendum-III	

	Modeller (1 No):	graduate/ MBA	kindly change this requirement to "Post graduate in Management / MBA/ CA"	
64	Addition of Legal Expert		It is suggested that since the scope	
			consists of drafting of tender	Tender condition prevails
			documents, etc we request the	
			authority to kindly include a Legal	
			Expert as an expert with the	
			following criteria:	
			Education – Graduate in Law	
			Total Experience – 10 Years	
			Experience on eligible	
			assignments -	
			• Experience in drafting	
			contractual agreements and	
			other related	
			documents/agreements	
			• Successful preparation of	
			documents for PPP projects	
			with either a LOI has been	
			issued to the preferred bidder or Concession	
			Agreement executed	
65	The Key Personnel shall be deployed on		This condition is very restrictive as	
	full time basis and must be full time		some experts are usually hired on	Tender condition prevails
	employee(s) of the firm.		project basis thus, we request the	F
			authority to drop this condition of	
			full time employees.	
66	Total Project Cost / Budget		We request the authority to kindly	•
			mention the Total Project Cost or	13.

		the budget for this project.	
67	Duration		lease refer clarification to point
		mention the duration / time-period 30	0
68	Drawings in DPR	of the assignment. We request the authority to clarify	
00	Drawings in Dr K	whether drawings are to be submitted in the DPR work.	es. The successful consultant has submit the drawings along with the DPR work
69	Joint Venture / Consortium/Association	allow Joint Venture / 16 Consortium/Association so as to	lease refer clarification to point 6 l refer Addendum III.
		In a similar case National Mission for Clean Ganga while empanelling the consultants, permitted Joint Venture / Consortium / Association.	
70	Composite Score of the Bidders		Please refer page no. 29 of tender ocument
71	Payment	We request the authority to make stage wise pro-rata payment for all the 12 projects.	ender Condition Prevails
72	Date Extension	extend the due date by 3 weeks.	l refer addendum –II
73	QCBS Evaluation 70:30	As this is the design intensive work where quality and technical strength of consultant is required. Therefore we request to you to pls consider it	ender condition prevails

			as 80:20 evaluation.	
M/s F	ortress Infrastructure Advisory Servi	ices		
74	General Query	Joint Venture / Consortium	We request you to allow the Joint Venture / Consortium of maximum 2 members. We also request you to consider	16
			the combined strength of all the JV/Consortium members for Eligibility and evaluation purpose.	
75	Clause 11.1 Earnest Money Deposit (Pg.13)	An EMD of Rs. 1,00,000.00 (Rupee One lac only), in the form of Demand Draft(DD) drawn in favour of Indian Ports Association, payable at New Delhi	We request you allow the Applicant to submit the Bid Security of Rs.1,00,000/- in the form of Bank Guarantee . Kindly provide the specimen format of Bank Guarantee for submission.	Tender condition prevails
76	Clause 10.1.1 (Pg.26)	Technical Evaluation Criteria Minimum Technical Score	Kindly inform about the requirement of minimum technical score to qualify.	Please refer page no 29 "Only those Bidders who have secured Technical Score(X) of 60 or above shall be declared as qualified for evaluation of their 'Financial Bid'. Bidders who have secured less than 60 for Technical Score shall be rejected."
77	Clause 10.1.1 : Technical Evaluation Criteria (Pg.26)	Sr.No.1: Team Leader cum Design Engineer: (1No): Post Graduate in Civil Engineering with Environmental Engg. Subjects having 20 years of total experience.	We request you to reconsider the requirement of Team Leader as under: "Post-Graduation in Civil Engineering having 15 years of total experience"	Pl refer Addendum-III